

Survey Supplement

Sustainable Development in Economic Sciences 2024

Definitions and descriptions

Contents

1	. (General Definitions	2
2		ESD Approaches	
_	2.1	ESD Competences	
	2.2	Level of ESD integration	
	2.3		
3	. 5	Subject areas (descriptions)	6
	3.1	Subject areas within business administration	6
	3.2	Subject areas within economics	7
	3.3	Subject areas within Banking & Finance	8
4	. 7	Teaching/Learning Methods (Descriptions)	10
	4.1	Teaching/learning approaches to promote critical and systemic thinking	10
	4.2	Teaching/learning approaches to promote reflection on values and emotions	12
	4.3	Teaching/learning approaches to promote action skills for sustainable development	15

1. General Definitions

Study programmes in economic sciences

We examine all study programmes at Bachelor's and Master's level with at least 50% content in the field of economic sciences and distinguish between the following sub-disciplines: Business Administration, Economics, Business Administration and Economics (combined), Banking & Finance.

Course/Module

The term course/module refers to a teaching unit within a study programme. Such a module may consist of lectures, seminars, project work or other formats. A course usually lasts one to two semesters and comprises 2-8 ECTS credits

Broad understanding of sustainability and sustainable development

The terms sustainability and sustainable development are used interchangeably in this document and in the survey. For sustainable development the ecological, social and economic dimensions are important – with regard to local, national, regional and global circles as well as current and future generations. Furthermore, a broad understanding of sustainability encompasses technological, cultural, psychological and philosophical aspects and perspectives. ¹

Strong sustainability

According to the concept of strong sustainability, the dimensions of sustainability mentioned above cannot be substituted: Planetary boundaries must be respected and the remaining stocks of "natural capital" must be preserved. On this basis, peaceful societies that are capable of learning and adapting can develop. An environment that is as intact as possible and a functioning society are prerequisites for a sustainable economy. This understanding of the interdependence of the three dimensions, ecology, economy and society is particularly relevant in the case of conflicting goals. Furthermore, the non-human environment ("nature") has an intrinsic value that goes beyond that of a mere "resource".²

Sustainability transformation

To enable sustainable development, we need a fundamental transformation of the economy and of the individual sectors, which also requires major political and social changes. In the sustainability transformation, democratic, constitutional, and liberal principles as well as human rights and international law should be promoted or at least respected. At the individual level, the understanding of the necessity of sustainable development as well as the personal development of attitudes, ways of thinking, decision-making and further key competences compatible with sustainability are to be promoted. ³

Goal framework

The 17 Sustainable Development Goals of the Agenda 2030 (SDGs) specify the target areas of sustainable development - and thus the relevant topics and aspects. ⁴

Sustainability-related

The term 'sustainability-related' refers to elements, practices or components within study programmes that relate directly to the principles and goals of sustainable development. This term stands for the explicit inclusion of ecological, social, and economic considerations, as well as interdisciplinary perspectives, ethical decision-making, and long-term societal and environmental well-being in the design, curriculum, and outcomes of study programmes.

Sustainability-focused

"Sustainability-focused" goes even further and refers to a profound commitment to focus on the principles and goals of sustainable development. This commitment is achieved by ensuring that (at least) 50% of the content of a study programme is directly related to sustainable development. This term stands for a deliberate and comprehensive integration of ecological, social, and economic considerations into the core structure, values, and outcomes of study programmes. Sustainability-focused elements go beyond incidental or peripheral integration and embody a holistic approach.

¹ Die Aachener Stiftung Kathy Beys: Lexikon der Nachhaltigkeit: Eintrag «Nachhaltigkeit Definition»; UN: Frequently Asked Questions: What is sustainable development?

² Die Aachener Stiftung Kathy Beys: Lexikon der Nachhaltigkeit: Eintrag *«Starke und schwache Nachhaltigkeit»*; UN (2015): Brief for GSDR 2015. Weak Sustainability versus Strong Sustainability

³ Irmi Seidl (2020): Grosse Transformation zur Nachhaltigen Entwicklung - Wie geht das?

⁴ UN: Sustainable Development Goals; Bundesamt für Raumentwicklung ARE: Agenda 2030 für nachhaltige Entwicklung

Interdisciplinary

Interdisciplinary approaches in higher education institutions involve the collaboration and integration of knowledge, methods and perspectives from different academic disciplines. This means overcoming traditional disciplinary boundaries to address complex problems that require insights from different fields. Interdisciplinary programmes foster a cross-fertilisation of ideas, encouraging students and faculty to engage in collaborative research and learning experiences that transcend the boundaries of individual disciplines. The aim is to provide a broader understanding of topics by drawing on different expertise and methodologies. For example, an interdisciplinary programme in economics brings together expertise from economics, psychology, and data science to explore the behavioural aspects that influence economic decisions.

Transdisciplinary

Transdisciplinary approaches within higher education institutions take interdisciplinary collaboration a step further by not only integrating knowledge from various disciplines but also transcending disciplinary boundaries altogether. In a transdisciplinary framework, the focus extends beyond academic disciplines to involve active engagement with non-academic stakeholders, including communities, industry, policymakers and many more. Transdisciplinary programmes in higher education seek to address real-world challenges by incorporating practical, on-the-ground perspectives, often requiring a deep integration of academic knowledge with practical expertise. The emphasis is on co-creating knowledge that is relevant and applicable across diverse contexts, fostering a holistic and inclusive understanding of complex issues. For example, a programme brings together economists, psychologists, data scientists, urban planners, environmental scientists, and community stakeholders to shape sustainable economic decision-making, integrating diverse perspectives and local contexts for comprehensive policy development.

Transfer

"Transfer" refers to the voluntary exchange of technologies, knowledge, ideas, and experiences between universities and practitioners. Practitioners encompass sectors such as business, politics, administrations, municipalities, associations, educational institutions, and other civil society organizations, initiatives, and citizens. The exchange primarily serves the purpose of addressing practical issues in society.⁵

The term "sustainability transfer" encompasses all transfer activities aimed at contributing to sustainable development in society. Sustainability transfer is characterized by the (explicit) sustainability goals of individual transfer activities and a description of the intended sustainability impact of each. The outcomes of sustainability transfer include a) contributions to sustainable development such as models, projects, technologies, concepts, solutions, tests, or discussions on sustainability, and b) the strengthening of the core competences of all involved parties for sustainable development through collaborative learning processes. 6

Education for Sustainable Development in Higher Education (ESD)

Education is indispensable for sustainable development. The concept of Education for Sustainable Development⁷ (ESD) includes not only topics and content, but also principles as well as teaching/learning approaches and learning methods that promote a comprehensive understanding of sustainable development as well as sustainabilityrelevant decision-making competences. The consistent integration of sustainable development into the Bachelor's, Master's, doctoral and postgraduate education programmes in the sense of ESD includes a generalist, broad understanding of sustainability, an in-depth examination of the discipline-specific topics and aspects of sustainable development, as well as an increased use of practice-oriented teaching/learning methods that promote decisionmaking competence and reflection. Such a comprehensive programme revision is being discussed internationally under the term "curriculum change".8

⁵ DG Hoch N (2021): Leitfaden Transfer für Nachhaltige Entwicklung an Hochschulen

⁶ Nölting B. et al. (2020): Transfer for Sustainable Development at Higher Education Institutions—Untapped Potential for Education for Sustainable Development and for Societal Transformation

éducation21: Was ist BNE?

⁸ Hoch-N: Bildung für Nachhaltige Entwicklung (BNE) in der Hochschullehre

2. ESD Approaches

2.1 ESD Competences

People in today's world need to be creative and self-organised as the complexity of situations exceeds basic problem-solving processes. Thus, also students must learn to understand the complex world in which they live. They need to be able to collaborate, express their opinions and advocate for positive change. To achieve this, students need to have certain key competences that allow them to engage constructively and responsibly within today's world. Competences describe the specific attributes individuals need for action and self-organization in various complex contexts and situations. In the context of sustainable development these key competences include:

- 1. **Competence in systems thinking**: the ability to recognize and understand relationships; to analyse complex systems; to think of how systems are embedded within different domains and different scales; and to deal with uncertainty.
- 2. **Anticipatory competence**: the abilities to understand and evaluate multiple futures possible, probable and desirable; to create one's own visions for the future; to apply the precautionary principle; to assess the consequences of actions; and to deal with risks and changes.
- 3. **Normative competence**: the abilities to understand and reflect on the norms and values that underlie one's actions; and to negotiate sustainability values, principles, goals, and targets, in a context of conflicts of interests and trade-offs, uncertain knowledge and contradictions.
- 4. **Strategic competence**: the ability to collectively develop and implement innovative actions that promote sustainability at the local level and further afield.
- 5. Collaboration competence: the abilities to learn from others; to understand and respect the needs, perspectives, and actions of others (empathy); to understand, relate to and be sensitive to others (empathic leadership); to deal with conflicts in a group; and to facilitate collaborative and participatory problem solving.
- 6. **Critical thinking competence**: the ability to question norms, practices, and opinions; to reflect on one's own values, perceptions and actions; and to take a position in the sustainability discourse.
- 7. **Self-awareness competence**: the ability to reflect on one's own role in the local community and (global) society; to continually evaluate and further motivate one's actions; and to deal with one's feelings and desires.
- 8. **Integrated problem-solving competence**: the overarching ability to apply different problem-solving frameworks to complex sustainability problems and develop viable, inclusive, and equitable solution options that promote sustainable development, integrating the abovementioned competences.
- 9. **Target competence**: the ability to identify, concretise and communicate the objectives relevant to sustainable development and to identify objectives that run counter to sustainability.¹⁰
- Transformation competence: the ability to initiate, advance and evaluate the social, economic, and political transformations necessary for sustainability - and to deal with resistance, setbacks and conflicting goals. ¹¹

2.2 Level of ESD integration

The level of integration describes the extent to which education for sustainable development is integrated into the study programme. There are four levels: ¹²

- No Integration: ESD is not integrated into the study programme
- **Add on**: ESD is added to the existing study programme, without substantial change to the study programme
- **Weave Through**: ESD is integrated into the existing study programme in a way that substantially changes the study programme. ESD is fully weaved through the whole content of the programme and is not viewed in an isolated way
- **Built in**: ESD as a whole concept is totally implemented into a study programme. There is a reorientation of existing content and approaches to benefit sustainable development

⁹ UNESCO (2017): Education for Sustainable Development Goals: learning objectives

¹⁰ After Wülser et al. (2011): Structuring complexity for tailoring research contributions to sustainable development: A framework

¹¹ After Wülser et al. (2011): Structuring complexity for tailoring research contributions to sustainable development: A framework

¹² Hoch-N: Bildung für Nachhaltige Entwicklung (BNE) in der Hochschullehre

2.3 ESD objectives and teaching/learning methods

Teaching/learning methods that promote ESD objectives:

ES	D objective areas and competences	Suitable teaching/learning methods ^{13 14 15}	Fundamentals and disciplines
A)	Teaching/learning approaches to promote critical and systemic thinking Systems thinking competence Anticipatory competence Strategic competence Critical thinking competence	 Inquiry-based learning, Research-based learning Experiential Learning Case-based learning with analysis on lines of argumentation Systems analysis and Scenario analysis Game-based learning, Simulation, Serious games, Narrative-based learning 	Cognitive psychology and philosophy (especially logic), systems theory, communication and media studies, relevant basic science(s) for the respective fields of practice
B)	Teaching/learning approaches to promote reflection on values and emotions Normative competence Collaboration competence Self-awareness competence Target competence	 Role-play-based learning with a change of perspective Inner Development Goals approaches Transformative Learning Critical service learning with a threefold perspective Mindfulness exercises (also in nature, with music or art) 	Philosophy (especially ethics), emotional and social psychology, inter- and transculturality, moral history, Concept of Inner Development Goals (IDG)
C)	Teaching/learning approaches to promote action skills for sustainable development Strategic competence Collaboration competence Integrated problem-solving competence Transformation competence	 Problem Based Learning Project Based Learning Action Learning Service Learning Learning in Living Labs and Design Thinking (also for Start-up foundation, Socio-political engagement, and other real-world projects) 	Business and organizational science (especially strategy, concept development, project management); motivational and action psychology, sociology, political science, communication, and digital sciences
D)	Interdisciplinary approaches in the context of sustainable development Systems thinking competence Normative competence Integrated problem-solving competence Target competence	 Interdisciplinary modules Contributions from lecturers and exchange with lecturers from different disciplines Project work with students from different disciplines Joint reflection on the different disciplinary perspectives, areas of tension and opportunities of interdisciplinary approaches 	Sustainability sciences, systems sciences, history and philosophy of science on the emergence of the disciplines Other discipline(s) for short introduction(s) to the chosen topic
E)	Transdisciplinary approaches in the context of sustainable development Systems thinking competence Normative competence Collaboration competence Transformation competence	 Transdisciplinary modules Contributions from (various) non-university stakeholders and exchange with non-university stakeholders Projects by students in collaboration with (various) practice partners Joint reflection on the different perspectives, areas of tension and opportunities of transdisciplinary approaches 	Sustainability sciences, systems sciences, innovation and transformation sciences (especially social innovation) Practical and experienced knowledge from the respective field of practice

UNESCO (2017): Education for Sustainable Development Goals: learning objectives
 Advance HE and QAA (2021): Education for Sustainable Development Guidance
 Lozano R., Bautista-Puig, N. and Barreiro-Gen M. (2022): Developing a sustainability competences paradigm in Higher Education or a White Elephant? Sustainable Development 30/5

3. Subject areas (descriptions)¹⁶

3.1 Subject areas within business administration

N°	Subject Area	Description
1.	Natural Resources, Global Environmental Problems and Goals	 Global problems and challenges Natural resources: concept, systematics, ecosystem services, special features of natural resource management Planetary Boundaries and Doughnut Economics Biodiversity: goals, instruments, and fields of action Climate change: goals, instruments and fields of action
2.	Sustainable Development and Sustainability Concepts	 Definition and dimensions of Sustainable Development Different sustainability concepts and their basic prerequisites (strong vs. weak sustainability) Key challenges and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Sustainability Transformation
3.	Proactive Corporate Social Responsibility (Alternative Business Models, Social Entrepreneurship)	 Reference to the core business: sustainable business models and social entrepreneurship Thinking about social problems and concerns from an outside-in perspective The role and importance of companies in society as (political) citizens ("citoyen")
4.	Reactive Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)	 Partial reference to the core business: donation ethics, risk and reputation management Thinking from within the company (inside-out perspective) The role and importance of companies in society as economic citizens ("bourgeois")
5.	Sustainability Strategy, Management and Reporting	 Definition of sustainability strategies and best practices Relevance and approaches of sustainability management from the perspective of various stakeholders and managers Concepts and systems of sustainability management (ESG, Science Based Target Initiative, Science Based Target Network, EU Taxonomy for sustainable activities) Gaining support for the implementation of sustainability projects Evaluation and reporting, Global Reporting Initiative (GRI)
6.	Sustainable Value Chain Management and Circular Economy	 Integration of sustainability and ethical issues into supply chain activities Sustainability challenges from a value chain perspective Management of sustainability risks and opportunities along the value chain Corporate responsibility in value chains Circular economy: 10R Principle, product design and standards, circularity processes, circular business model
7.	Companies and Human Rights	 Legal and institutional framework: the duty of companies to respect human rights The right to compensation in case of human rights violations suffered by economic stakeholders Current and evolving debates on corporate responsibility for the respect of human rights along the value chain
8.	Marketing, Communication and Sustainability	 Ethical implications in marketing Interrelationships between marketing and sustainable consumption How can the negative effects of all the company's marketing processes on its natural and social environment be minimised Concept of sustainability marketing and its benefits for Sustainable Development Communication as a key to changing behaviour
9.	Sustainable Financial Management (Raising Capital & Investments)	 Sustainability in raising capital on and off the stock exchange Principles of responsible investment and possible strategies Potential contribution of responsible investment to a sustainable economy New methods and instruments of financial management to integrate social and environmental aspects into decision-making

¹⁶ The following subject areas are particularly relevant to Sustainable Development in Economic Sciences. The selection is based on relevant literature and assessments by experts inside and outside universities.

		Disinvestment strategies
10.	Sustainable Human Resource Management and personal development	 The role of human resource management in the development and implementation of sustainability strategies Social and environmental effects of personnel decisions (including employee health, diversity management and employee volunteering) Modern/participative approaches to personnel management and task distribution Equal treatment, development, and well-being of employees Inner Development Goals (IDG), mindfulness, personal resilience, Green HRM
11.	Digitalisation, AI and Sustainable Development	 Opportunities of digital/Al innovations for Sustainable Development Ecological, social, psychological und systemic risks of digital/Al transformation Principles and approaches to sustainable digitalization
12.	Innovation Management, social innovation and impact creation	 Importance and opportunities of innovation in solving global sustainability challenges Key concepts and theories for sustainability-oriented innovations Importance of social innovation Impact creation and evaluation of innovations
13.	Sustainable Business Transformation and Leadership for Sustainability	 Principles and approaches of sustainable business transformation Change management, psychological and social aspects Positive Leadership, Leadership for sustainability Evaluation of ecological and business indicators
14.	Sustainable Consumption	 Lifestyles that have sustainability as their goal (including a sufficient lifestyle) Sustainability in selected areas of everyday activities: housing, nutrition, mobility, leisure, health Ecological footprint and the consequences of consumption Promoting and inhibiting factors of sustainable lifestyles

3.2 Subject areas within economics

N°	Subject Area	Description
1.	Natural Resources, Global	Global problems and challenges
	Environmental Problems and	 Natural resources: concept, systematics, ecosystem services,
	Goals	special features of natural resource management
		 Planetary Boundaries and Doughnut Economics
		 Biodiversity: goals, instruments, and fields of action
		Climate change: goals, instruments and fields of action
2.	Sustainable Development	 Definition and dimensions of Sustainable Development
	and Sustainability Concepts	 Different sustainability concepts and their basic prerequisites (strong vs. weak sustainability)
		Key challenges and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)
_	Discribed in Essential	Sustainability Transformation
3.	Pluralism in Economics (Schools of Thought)	Different critical understandings of science (ontology, anistance of the delayers, mostly add)
	(Schools of Thought)	epistemology, methodology, methods)
		Heterodox Economics: different schools of thought such as institutional accompanies and the Austrian
		institutional economics, ecological economics, and the Austrian School
		Diversity of problems statements (e.g. scarcity and insecurity)
4.	Sustainable Economy	Goals and principles of a sustainable economy
	·	 Important approaches (e.g. green economy, circular economy, sharing economy, public welfare economy, prosperity without growth, prosperity in time, fair globalisation)
		Postal growth and prosperity and its measurability
		GDP and alternative measurement of economic performance and
		social progress
		Opportunities and risks of a sustainable economy
5.	Transformation into a	Approaches, instruments, and measures for the further
	Sustainable Economy	development of the economy into a sustainable economy and their effectiveness
		 Strategy paths towards a sustainable economy: efficiency, consistency, sufficiency strategy
		Policy instruments: economic, regulatory and voluntary instruments

Sust	Sustainable Development in Economics Sciences 2024 – Survey Supplement		
6.	Globalisation & Sustainability	 Understanding the consequences of globalisation for Sustainable Development Connection of globalisation with development problems in the Global South Impact of globalisation on the environment Opportunities of globalisation for Sustainable Development (including globalisation to eliminate inequalities between countries) 	
7.	Development Economics	 Basic problems of development economics Causes of underdevelopment Development policy approaches and instruments Growth and development theories The role of development aid in economic development 	
8.	Equity of Opportunity and Distribution	 Gender equality Causes and risks of unequal distribution of income and wealth Strategies for distributive justice Commitment by decision-makers to a fair distribution of life chances and income 	
9.	Sustainable Financial Economy	 Theoretical framework of sustainability and its relevance to the financial sector Innovative and sustainable concepts from the areas of investment and financing and their influence on the sustainability of the financial system Obstacles to greater sustainability of the financial sector Measures for a responsible use of financial products and greater stability of the financial markets Lessons from the financial crisis: banks as triggers of crises; derivatives and systemic risks Ethical behaviour and role models in banking 	
10.	Economy of the Environment, Resources, Biodiversity and Climate	 Scope for economic action given the ecological limits of the viability of natural systems Environmental Economics: assessment of what is put into the environment: environmental damage, biodiversity economics, climate economics Resource Economics: assessment of what is taken out of nature 	
11.	Sustainable Consumption	 Lifestyles that have sustainability as their goal (including a sufficient lifestyle) Sustainability in selected areas of everyday activities: housing, nutrition, mobility, leisure, health Ecological footprint and the consequences of consumption Promoting and inhibiting factors of sustainable lifestyles 	

3.3 Subject areas within Banking & Finance

N°	Subject Area	Description
1.	Natural Resources, Global Environmental Problems and Goals	 Global problems and challenges Natural resources: concept, systematics, ecosystem services, special features of natural resource management Planetary Boundaries and Doughnut Economics Biodiversity: goals, instruments, and fields of action Climate change: goals, instruments and fields of action
2.	Understanding and concepts of sustainability	 Definition and dimensions of Sustainable Development Different sustainability concepts and their basic prerequisites (strong vs. weak sustainability) Key challenges and Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) Sustainability Transformation
3.	Sustainable Financial Economy	 Theoretical framework of sustainability and its relevance to the financial sector Innovative and sustainable concepts from the areas of investment and financing and their influence on the sustainability of the financial system, UN Environment Programme Finance Initiative Obstacles to greater sustainability in the financial sector Measures for a responsible use of financial products and greater stability of the financial markets Lessons from the financial crisis: banks as triggers of crises; derivatives and systemic risks Ethical behaviour and role models in banking

Sust	ainable Development in Ecor	nomics Sciences 2024 – Survey Supplement
4 .	Sustainable and Responsible Investment (SRI) Sustainability in Banks	 Main concepts, history, current trend, market shares and today's product landscape and main stakeholders Sustainable investment strategies and concepts (e.g. EU Taxonomy for sustainable activities) Socio-economic characteristics, opportunities, and risks of sustainable investments Best practices to integrate environmental, social and governance criteria into the value chain of the investment process Assessment tools and key performance indicators for SRI risk analysis and performance measurement Sustainability assessment and reporting (GRI), which are necessary for informed SRI investment decisions Sustainability in the banking industry, overview of theory, concepts
J.	Sustainability in Danks	 Sustainability in the banking industry, overview of theory, concepts and challenges, sustainable credit and underwriting standards Environmental and social risks in lending Sustainability as an opportunity for banking and underwriting: current practices, products, and gaps Sustainability strategy in banks: UN Principles for Responsible Banking The role of banks in moving towards a low-carbon and nature positive economy
6.	Sustainability in Insurance Companies	 Sustainability in the insurance industry, overview of theory, concepts, and challenges Environmental and social risks Sustainability as an opportunity for insurance companies: current practices, products, and gaps Sustainability strategy in insurance companies: UN Principles for Sustainable Insurance (PSI) The role of insurance and reinsurance companies in moving towards a low-carbon and nature positive economy
7.	Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR)	 Reference to the core business: sustainable business models and social entrepreneurship vs. donation ethics, risk and reputation management Perspective: thinking based on social problems and concerns (outside-in) vs. thinking from within the company (inside-out) The role and importance of companies in society as (political) citizens ("citoyen") vs. economic citizens ("bourgeois")
8.	Evaluation of the Sustainability Performance of Companies	 The importance of evaluating the sustainability performance of companies in connection with SRI Tools for measuring sustainability performance in companies Assessment of how a consistent sustainability performance can be ensured Review of sustainability reporting and assurance
9.	Microfinance	 Microfinance overview, products and product development Evaluation of the financial and social performance of microfinance service providers Risk management in microfinance institutions Microinsurance: health and agricultural insurance
10.	Climate Change Finance	 Factors that contribute to climate-related risks Ways in which climate risks can translate into financial risks Possibilities for mitigation and adaptation using different market mechanisms (e.g. taxation, carbon pricing) Climate funds (e.g. Green Climate Fund)
11.	Biodiversity and Finance	 Factors that contribute to biodiversity-related risks Ways in which biodiversity risks can translate into financial risks Possibilities for mitigation and adaptation using different market mechanisms (e.g. taxation, pricing) UN Biodiversity Finance Initiative (BIOFIN) Biodiversity funds

4. Teaching/Learning Methods (Descriptions)

4.1 Teaching/learning approaches to promote critical and systemic thinking

1. Inquiry-based learning, research-based learning

Inquiry-based teaching is a university didactic format in which students conduct their own research as part of seminars or projects. As students acquire knowledge independently and thus construct it, inquiry-based teaching belongs to the group of constructivist forms of teaching and learning.

Most universities in the German-speaking world use Ludwig Huber's definition as a working definition of inquiry-based teaching: "Inquiry-based teaching is distinguished from other forms of learning by the fact that the students (co-)design, experience and reflect on the process of a research project aimed at gaining knowledge that is also of interest to third parties in its essential phases – from the development of questions and hypotheses to the selection and execution of methods and the examination and presentation of the results as independent work or through active participation in an overarching project." Levels¹⁷:

- 1. Students are provided with questions, methods and materials and are encouraged to discover relationships between variables
- 2. Students are given a research question, but the research method is developed by the students
- 3. Phenomena are suggested but students must develop their own questions and research methods to discover the relationships between the variables
- 4. The specific learning processes that people go through during enquiry-based learning include:
- · Asking their own questions
- Obtaining supporting evidence to answer the question(s)
- · Explaining the evidence collected
- Linking the explanation to the knowledge gained through the enquiry process
- Creating an argument and justification for the explanation

2. Experiential Learning

Experiential Learning Model/Cycle, according to David Kolb

The Kolb Experiential Learning Theory¹⁸, developed by David A. Kolb, is widely recognized and influential framework that describes how people learn through experience. Since learning is the primary process used to navigate life, people can use this process for all forms of learning, development, and change. Learning occurs in any setting and continues throughout life. The experiential learning process supports performance improvement, learning and development.

David Kolb described the ideal process of learning in a four-step Experiential Learning Cycle: Experiencing – Reflecting – Thinking – Acting.

- 1. Experiencing (Concrete Experience): Learning begins when a learner uses senses and perceptions to engage in what is happening now.
- 2. Reflecting (Reflective Observation): After the experience, a learner reflects on what happened and connects feelings with ideas about the experience.
- 3. Thinking (Abstract Conceptualization): The learner engages in thinking to reach conclusions and form theories, concepts, or general principles that can be tested
- 4. Acting (Active Experimentation): The learner tests the theory and applies what was learned to get feedback and create the next experience.

3. Case-based learning with analysis on lines of argumentation

developed by Harvard Law School

In a case study¹⁹, students are presented a "case" which describes a problematic situation (real or fictional). The students are given the task of working out a solution or making a decision. Case studies are often used to enhance lessons. The solution is usually left open and the students are expected to work out a plausible result themselves. There are also case studies that provide the solution and encourage the students to discuss it and look for alternatives. A case study is therefore a description of a situation and its influencing factors that has been prepared for teaching purposes and that aims to achieve both an active examination of the content as well as specific action by the student. A case study is therefore not synonymous with an "example".

A distinction can be made between the following case types²⁰:

- Problem-finding case
- · Decision-making case
- Assessment case
- · Information case
- Investigation case

¹⁷ Wikipedia (English)

¹⁸ Institute4 for Experiental Learning: What is Experiental Learning?

¹⁹ Harvard Law School: The Case Study Teaching Method

²⁰ Wikipedia (German)

The learning effects of each case type differ as follows:

- · Information: the data relevant to the case solution can be complete, incomplete or not available at all.
- Problem: the problem or problems underlying the case study can be explicitly specified. In contrast, the student may also be required to identify the problems independently and evaluate their relevance.
- Solution: the student has to search for alternative solutions and may be asked to choose one. The solution can also be anticipated and made the subject of discussion.

Argumentation includes various forms of dialogue such as deliberation and negotiation which are concerned with collaborative decision-making procedures. It also encompasses eristic dialog, the branch of social debate in which victory over an opponent is the primary goal, and didactic which serves teaching purposes. This discipline also studies the means by which people can express and rationally resolve or at least manage their disagreements. Case studies (or media articles) can be used to critically analyse the lines of argumentation presented and to discover implications, hidden messages, connections and contradictions.

4. Systems analysis and scenario analysis

Systems analysis is the process of studying a procedure or business to identify its goal and purposes and create systems and procedures that will efficiently achieve them. Another view sees system analysis as a problem-solving technique that breaks down a system into its component pieces, and how well those parts work and interact to accomplish their purpose.

The basis can be Case studies (see above), system descriptions from the literature or fields of practice examined. Steps:²¹

- 1. Survey and analysis of a given problem
- 2. Specification of a general objective
- 3. Defining the system boundaries to differentiate between the system and the environment
- 4. Determine those system elements that are considered relevant to the problem
- 5. Determine the relationships between the system elements that are considered relevant to the problem
- 6. Determine the system properties at the macro level
- 7. Determine the relationships of the system to the environment or to other systems, if the system is considered as an isolated or closed system instead of an open system

The presentation can be quantitative, semi-quantitative or qualitative.

Scenario analysis²²: Our future is not predictable; nevertheless, long-term planning security is of great relevance for various disciplines. Based on concrete research questions the scenario method develops different possible future projections of complex and uncertain systems with the aim to:

- assess middle and long-term changes,
- estimate required future states and be able to plan accordingly,
- assess possible catastrophes and negative changes,
- sharpen common awareness and co-creation of knowledge.

Scenarios allow a better understanding of complex correlations in future contexts. Complex systems are being reduced to essential components but without losing sight of their interconnectedness.

A scenario is defined as "a coherent, internally consistent and plausible description of a possible future state of the world. It is not a forecast; rather, each scenario is one alternative image of how the future can unfold". Hence it is not enough to develop and analyse only one scenario, but multiple scenarios need to be developed in order to demonstrate the diversity of potential future developments.

Scenarios...

- are simplified descriptions of a potential future,
- · are based on a consistent set of assumptions and not on probabilities,
- are group-subjective,
- do not predict the future but present a systematic consideration of the future.

Five steps of scenario analysis:

- Step 1: Case and goal definition
- Step 2: Identification of key variables
- Step 3: Scenario construction
- Step 4: Scenario analysis and interpretation
- Step 5: Scenario transfer

5. Game-based learning, simulation, serious games, narrative-based learning

Simulation and learning games belong to a group of methods that creates a realistic environment in which behaviour can be tested. Often these games/activities are also used to start a (teaching) series. They are suitable for generating concern/empathy or for putting a group in a certain situation that they can otherwise only experience cognitively rather than emotionally.

-

²¹ Wikipedia (German)

²² Sustainicum Collection

Four functions are distinguished in simulations and learning games:

- Diagnostic function: how does a person behave in a certain function?
- Feedback function: a player receives feedback on behaviour or its effect.
- Training function: new behaviour patterns are tested and optimised.
- Perspective function: players slip into other roles in order to be able to assess (social) situations from other perspectives (e.g. role reversal).

A serious game is a board, card or computer game that is not primarily or exclusively intended for entertainment, but may contain such elements. What serious games - as well as educational games - have in common is the desire to convey information and education; this should be done in a balanced a relationship with entertainment aspects. Real simulations and simulation games provide the user with the opportunity to gain experience. Actions generated from knowledge can be tested here according to the trial and error principle. Theoretical knowledge can either be acquired beforehand or imparted during the game, which can then be tested in a virtual practice.²³

Narrative-based learning is a learning model grounded in the theory that humans define their experiences within the context of narratives - which serve as cognitive structures and a means of communication, as well as aiding people in framing and understanding their perceptions of the world. Narrative contextualises abstract concepts and provides a scaffold for the transfer of knowledge within specific contexts and environments. This model aligns with the constructivist ideals of situated learning - which theorises that active learning takes place within the context in which the knowledge must be applied. Anchored Instruction is a type of situated learning that presents students with a realistic narrative within a specific context. At the narrative's core is a problem that must be solved by constructing and applying the knowledge within the targeted learning domain.²⁴

4.2 Teaching/learning approaches to promote reflection on values and emotions

1. Role-play-based learning with a change of perspective

In education, role-playing is an important method of social group work. As a rule, real life situations are simulated. One aim is for the participants to expand their social skills by playing out critical or themed situations in simulated reality. Furthermore, the players can try out their respective roles, try to behave according to the role and learn to accept others in other roles. The aim is also to acquire skills in dealing with serious situations (e.g. dealing with conflicts).

The roles assigned can be very different or very similar to the character of the persons. If the roles also correspond to the characters of the group participants, the role swap provides the opportunity to experience the feelings and thoughts of the others.

The aims of a role play can be:

- Getting to know the social possibilities in certain situations
- Getting to know your own limits: For example, how long can I put up with verbal abuse?
- Changing behavioural patterns: For example, by practicing de-escalation rhetoric
- Developing empathy: For example, by swapping roles or as an external observer of your own role, played by someone else
- Opening up to the outside world and overcoming fears: On the basis that role play can offer a protected space
- Empathizing with the experiences of others through your own play: Making the experiences of others your own
- Acquiring knowledge in connection with corresponding social situations
- Visualization of complex social situations that are difficult/hard to reproduce in the media

Ultimately, role play is a pedagogical opportunity to gain a sense of the differentiation of one's own identity. By interacting with others, even if only in the simulated situations of the game, I improve my perception and my social skills. Both help me to define and differentiate my role and position in groups.

A change of perspective enables empathy, i.e., the ability and willingness to recognize, understand and empathize with the feelings, emotions, thoughts, motives, and personality traits of another person. Empathy is also generally considered to be the ability to react appropriately to other people's feelings, for example compassion, sadness, pain and a willingness to help out of sympathy. The basis of empathy is self-awareness - the more open a person is to their own emotions, the better they can interpret the feelings of others - as well as self-transcendence in order to overcome egocentric attitudes.²⁵

2. Critical Service Learning (CSL) with a threefold perspective

According to T.D. Mitchell

Service learning is a teaching method that combines social commitment with professional learning in the classroom. Service learning combines cognitive learning with the assumption of responsibility (service) (s. below). Service learning is an effective approach to promoting action skills. However, there is a risk that it cements existing inequalities and power imbalances, especially if students act from a position of superiority towards target groups and thus practice this habitus.

²⁵ Wikipedia (German)

²³ Wikipedia (German, English)

²⁴ Wikipedia (English)

In order to promote action skills as well as critical thinking and reflection on values, approaches are needed that enable active action in practice.

CSL complements the traditional understanding of SL with three additional objectives²⁶:

- A social change orientation
- Working to redistributive power
- Developing authentic relationships

In order to develop a critical attitude (towards the system, the existing social order and one's own role), regular guided reflection phases (individual and group) are required.

Self-reflection refers to the activity of thinking about oneself. This means analysing and questioning one's thoughts, feelings and actions with the aim of finding out more about oneself. We can question ourselves not only as an individual person, but also as part of a system, for example as part of a family or a team.

Self-reflection can be encouraged through methods such as: self-dialogue, storytelling, narrative methods, working with metaphors, journals, The Six Minute Write²⁷, Think-pair-share, Six Thinking Hats, More than words²⁸

A contemporary understanding of SL in the context of ESD also includes an integration of the three perspectives: Lecturers, students, practice partners. All three stakeholder groups should meet as equals, they must benefit from the SL project and all are learners in this setting.²⁹

3. Transformative learning

According to Jack Mezirow

Transformative learning, as a theory, says that the process of "perspective transformation" has three dimensions: psychological (changes in understanding of the self), convictional (revision of belief systems), and behavioural (changes in lifestyle).

Transformative learning is the expansion of consciousness through the transformation of basic worldview and specific capacities of the self; transformative learning is facilitated through consciously directed processes such as appreciatively accessing and receiving the symbolic contents of the unconscious and critically analysing underlying

The perspective transformation is explained by Mezirow as follows³⁰:

- 1. Disorienting dilemma
- 2. Self-examination
- Sense of alienation 3.
- 4. Relating discontent to others
- 5. Explaining options of new behaviour
- 6. Building confidence in new ways
- 7. Planning a course of action
- 8. Knowledge to implement plans
- Experimenting with new roles 9.
- 10. Reintegration.

Mezirow distinguishes between four forms of learning:

- Learning on the basis of existing meaning schemes
- Learning new meaning schemes
- Learning through the transformation of meaning schemes
- Learning through the transformation of meaning perspectives

When learning through existing meaning schemes, knowledge is gained within an existing frame of reference, whereby the meaning schemes are differentiated and refined. However, the way in which the world is interpreted does not change, as the meaning perspectives remain unchanged. When learning new meaning schemes, the scope of application of existing meaning perspectives is expanded, whereby the meaning perspectives are not changed but strengthened. Here too, the framework for action remains the same, only additional schemata are added to support a perspective. No transformation takes place in these two forms of learning; only the latter two forms of learning are attributed to transformative learning in the classical sense. When learning through the transformation of meaning schemata, the existing schemata are changed by adding something or combining different schemata. Existing schemata are broken up and replaced or expanded by new ones. If meaning schemas change fundamentally, this can have an effect on the meaning perspective and change it too. According to Mezirow, learning through the transformation of meaning perspectives is the "most important type of emancipatory learning" and requires critical reflection on one's own way of thinking about how one arrives at one's meanings and interprets one's experiences. In such a reflexive way of thinking, the perspectives of meaning are questioned and changed. It is only through the reflexive transformation of meaning schemes and perspectives that learning becomes transformative.³¹ Central elements for this form of learning are experience, critical reflection, and rational discourse.

²⁶ Mitchell, T. D. (2008). Traditional vs. critical service-learning: Engaging the literature to differentiate two models. Michigan Journal of Community Service Learning, 14, 50-65) ²⁷ Wikipedia (German)

²⁸ Sustainicum Collection

²⁹ Fischer Manuel et al. (2023): Critical Service Learning im Kontext von Bildung für Nachhaltige Entwicklung (BNE) unter Integration der drei Perspektiven Studierende, Hochschule und Praxispartnerinnen und -partner. In: Becker, I., Kastner, F, Schank, Ch. & Studer, J. (Hrsg). (2023). Service Learning an deutschsprachigen Hochschulen. Perspektivisch, nachhaltig, umgesetzt. Bern: hep

³⁰ Mezirow, J. (1995). "Transformation Theory of Adult Learning." In: In Defense of the Lifeworld, edited by M.R. Welton, pp. 39– 70. New York: SUNY Press

³¹ Mezirow, Jack: "Learning to Think Like an Adult: Core Concepts of Transformation Theory" In: Taylor, Edward W.; Cranton, Patricia: "The Handbook of Transformative Learning. Theory, Research and Practice." Jossey-Bass, San Francisco 2012

4. Inner development goals approaches

The IDGs will provide a framework of transformative skills for sustainable development. The current IDGs framework represents 5 dimensions and 23 skills and qualities which are especially crucial for leaders who address SDGs, but fundamentally for all.³²

The five dimensions:

- 1. Being Relationship to oneself
- 2. Thinking Cognitive Skills
- 3. Relating Caring for Others and the World
- 4. Collaborating Social Skills
- 5. Acting Enabling Change

A toolkit describes different learning methods for each dimension such as compassion training, nonviolent communication and Theory U for groupwork.³³

Mindfulness exercises (also in nature, with music or art)

Rooted in Buddhist meditation discourses, as a spiritual or salutogenic practice, mindfulness means maintaining a moment-by-moment awareness of our thoughts, feelings, bodily sensations, and surrounding environment in a gentle, nurturing lens. This accepting and non-judgemental way of taking care of our thoughts and feelings supports a compassionate view on the self, the other, and the world. Practicing mindfulness supports sensing in the present moment rather than rehashing the past or imagining the future. Rooted in ancient spiritual wisdoms, cosmologies and epistemologies of the so-called eastern and southern worlds, mindfulness already deeply contains a complex notion of sustainability. "Deep Ecology" perspectives relate to the connectedness of all things between the universe, any other being, and the self. Not to focus on borders and antinomies, but on the unity of space and time offers a different concept of the Self as nonseparated from the dynamic globe and universe. It decentres humanity into a position of conviviality with the global and universal ecosystem. Within sustainability discourses the deep transformative potential of learning sustainability, sustainability learning, and mindfulness in sustainability is addressed. As the discourse of mindfulness has become relevant in many spheres and academic fields, in a secular Western and individualized discourse, mindfulness does relate to individual or organizational wellbeing. These salutogenic discourses refer to the beneficial effects of mindfulness on physical and mental health and to the quality and potential of organizational mindfulness. They connect to sustainability in many implicit and explicit ways.³⁴

There are several exercises designed to develop mindfulness meditation, which may be aided by guided meditations "to get the hang of it". As forms of self-observation and interoception, these methods increase awareness of the body, so they are usually beneficial to people with low self-awareness or low awareness of their bodies or emotional state, and can provoke anxiety, distress, flashbacks, pain, and even trigger substance abuse in people who are very focused on themselves, their bodies, and their emotions.

- One method is to sit in a straight-backed chair or sit cross-legged on the floor or a cushion, close one's eyes and bring attention to either the sensations of breathing in the proximity of one's nostrils or to the movements of the abdomen when breathing in and out. In this meditation practice, one does not try to control one's breathing, but attempts to simply be aware of one's natural breathing process/rhythm. When engaged in this practice, the mind will often run off to other thoughts and associations, and if this happens, one passively notices that the mind has wandered, and in an accepting, non-judgmental way, returns to focusing on breathing.
- In body-scan meditation the attention is directed at various areas of the body and noting body sensations that happen in the present moment.
- One could also focus on sounds, sensations, thoughts, feelings and actions that happen in the present. In this regard, a famous exercise, is the mindful tasting of a raisin, in which a raisin is being tasted and eaten mindfully. By enabling reconnection with internal hunger and satiety cues, mindful eating has been suggested to be a means of maintaining healthy and conscious eating patterns.
- Other approaches include practicing yoga asanas while attending to movements and body sensations, and walking meditation.³⁵

_

³² Inner Development Goals

³³ Inner Development Goals: Research Report

³⁴ Susanne Maria Weber and Marc-André Heidelmann: Mindfulness in Sustainability. In: Walter Leal Filho (Ed.) (2019): Encyclopedia of Sustainability in Higher Education. Cham: Springer Nature
³⁵ Wikipedia (English)

4.3 Teaching/learning approaches to promote action skills for sustainable development

1. Problem-Based Learning

According to John Dewey

Problem-Based Learning (PBL)³⁶, also known as Problem-Oriented Learning (POL), is a form of learning in which learners are expected to find a solution to a given problem largely independently.

Typically, the method is planned with seven phases ("seven-jump process"):

- 1. Clarification of unknown terms
- 2. Topic identification or problem definition
- 3. Brainstorming on hypothesis generation
- 4. Systematic ordering and evaluation of the hypotheses
- 5. Formulation of learning objectives
- 6. Research ("learning time")
- 7. Synthesis

2. Project-Based Learning

According to William Heard Kilpatrick

Project-Based Learning³⁷, also referred to as project teaching or project work, is a form of teaching and learning based around a central project idea. It is an innovative method that strives to achieve more proximity to life, problem awareness and interdisciplinary thinking as well as independence and willingness to cooperate. The project usually goes through the following phases³⁸:

- Initiation the meaning of project teaching is explained and ideas for projects are found.
- Start the selected project is set in motion.
- Planning negotiations take place to determine who does what, when, where, with whom.
- Implementation the project is given a practical form.
- Presentation the project results are presented.
- Evaluation the project results are reflected on.
- Continuation follow-up projects are initiated.

3. Action Learning

Action-oriented learning, based on a real project, according to Reginald W. Revans

Action Learning³⁹ is a method of experiential learning ("Learning by Doing") for individuals or groups in companies or other organisations.

In Action Learning, a team works on a specific project that is relevant to an organisation whilst at the same time reflecting on the learning process. The method typically includes the following elements:

- The decision to act originates from a client who is directly interested in the solution of a task. The team
 or its participants conclude a specific project agreement with the client. This contains all the important
 points concerning the result to be achieved, the way and means to do so, as well as details of the use of
 resources and responsibilities.
- A commitment to learn on the part of the participants is a prerequisite for the programme. Participants
 must have the will to learn new things: they are asked to improve the effectiveness of their own
 behaviour as leaders or part of the team, to gain a better understanding of their environment and to
 discover personal possibilities for exerting influence.
- The Set (which refers to a group of action learners) is central to learning success in order to encourage
 active participation in the solution of the task through group dynamics. In the Set, each member takes
 responsibility not only for their own learning success, but also for the learning success of the group as a
 whole. The Set usually consists of four to six participants, up to a maximum of eight. Ideally, they should
 have different professional and management backgrounds.
- The facilitator helps the Set to reflect on and evaluate the project experiences. He or she helps to resolve conflicts, promotes a climate of trust and provides a focus for discussions.
- A process of questioning and reflection promotes exchange and collective learning within the group.
 Frequently used methods for this are team reflection and problem-solving interviews.

-

³⁶ Wikipedia (English) and Cornell University. Center for Teaching Innovation

³⁷ Boston University. Center for Teaching and Learning

³⁸ Wikipedia (German)

³⁹ Wikipedia (English) and World Institute for Action Learning: What is Action Learning?

4. Service Learning

according to Robert Sigmon

Service learning is a teaching method that combines social commitment with professional learning in the classroom. Service learning combines cognitive learning with the assumption of responsibility (service)⁴⁰.

Service-learning combines academic teaching with civil society involvement. For example: law students who develop and run a legal advice centre for refugees.

In doing so, young people learn that it is worthwhile to work for the community. They practise social and democratic skills and are able to apply their practical knowledge and experience to their studies. In this way, teaching becomes practical and hands-on. Service learning is thus based on the principle that social commitment can be combined with professional learning. In this way, "service" and "learning" benefit from each other: on the one hand, social commitment is enriched by the theoretical and conceptual knowledge acquired by the students during their studies, and on the other hand, professional learning gains relevance, reference to specific actions and depth of understanding through real-life experiences.

Service Learning is based on eight evidence-based and widely-negotiated quality standards:

- Meaningful Service
- Link to Curriculum
- · Reflection
- Diversity
- Youth Voice
- Partnerships
- Progress Monitoring
- Duration and Intensity

5. Learning in Living Labs and Design Thinking (also for start-up foundation, socio-political engagement and other real-world projects)

Living labs (or Real-world laboratories) are a new form of cooperation between science and civil society which focuses on mutual learning in an experimental environment. Stakeholders from science and practice come together to develop and test scientifically and socially robust solutions based on a common understanding of a problem. The laboratory concept is extended from beyond its classical scientific and engineering meaning to a social context. It is expected that the scientific findings developed via living labs will be more easily taken up by politics, civil society and business, and that society will thus become more capable of taking action with regard to sustainable development.

In living labs, exciting learning projects can often be initiated and implemented by students. Such learning projects in real laboratories can be seen as a special form of project-based learning (see above) but goes beyond that. In particular, intensive interaction with various practical stakeholders and the inclusion of their perspectives and interests result in real projects that reach a higher and more demanding level of complexity. The projects can be located at very different levels, e.g.:

- political projects
- practical non-commercial projects (if a civil society group benefits from the project, it becomes "service learning", see above)
- Purpose-driven start-ups (social entrepreneurship)

Close interaction between study content and practical implementation is crucial to ensure an optimal learning effect and develop real skills.⁴¹

Design thinking is an iterative methodology for (re)framing problems and co-creating implementable solutions using visual thinking and prototyping and a collaborative problem-solving strategy. Design thinking:

- a) connects the needs of people involved in the problem to researchers'/experts' observations of the problem;
- b) focuses on creating innovative ways of looking at the problem;
- c) embraces visualization, storytelling, and experimentation through building and testing prototypes.

The approach is based on the assumption that framing problems in new ways can lead to more implementable and innovative solutions.

In the context of education, design thinking can be used to build collaborative skills of students to tackle complex problems in interdisciplinary settings.

The five-step methodology of design thinking is embedded in a human-centred mindset. The steps are group processes accompanied by a facilitator.

- 1. Empathize The group gathers information about the problem situation and collects insights on a particular theme. These insights are specific in time and place, usually pinpoint a contradiction, and explain why or how things work.
- 2. Define The group identifies and agrees upon the insights that are most surprising or meaningful to its members.
- 3. Ideate Using each problem statement as a focus, the group brainstorms potential solutions.
- 4. Prototype Group members transform the chosen ideas into physically concrete objects or conceptual papers.
- 5. Test Prototypes are presented to other stakeholders as soon as possible. 42

⁴⁰ ben:edu – Schweizer Netzwerk Service Learning an Hochschulen: Service Learning

⁴¹ ETH Zurich, USYS TdLab: Living Labs and Netzwerk Reallabore der Nachhaltigkeit

⁴² scnat knowledge. Methods and tools for co-producing knowledge: Design thinking



Together, we protect the environment and create a future worth living for generations to come.

WWF Switzerland

Hohlstrasse 110 PO Box 8010 Zurich

Phone: +41 (0) 44 297 21 21 Fax: +41 (0) 44 297 21 00 www.wwf.ch/contact www.wwf.ch

Donations: PC 80-470-3